European framework to decrease the burden of TB/HIV

By: Pierpaolo de Colombani
Nicholas Banatvala
Richard Zaleskis
Dermot Maher
European framework to decrease the burden of TB/HIV
Abstract

Tuberculosis in Europe is declining in countries in western and central Europe, but the burden is still high and increasing in eastern Europe. HIV/AIDS is increasing dramatically in eastern Europe. HIV-related tuberculosis (TB/HIV) morbidity and mortality are expected to accelerate significantly in the future.

This framework aims to guide European countries in developing their national plan for reducing TB/HIV morbidity and mortality. It results from an extensive consultation process undertaken by the WHO Regional Office for Europe and by those responsible for HIV/AIDS and tuberculosis programmes and their partners. It builds on strategies developed globally and in Europe for tuberculosis control and for HIV/AIDS prevention and care.

This framework sets out the rationale for effective collaboration between HIV/AIDS and tuberculosis national programmes. It identifies five strategic components (political commitment, collaborative prevention, intensified case-finding, coordinated treatment, strengthened surveillance) and eight key operations (central coordination, policy development, surveillance, training, supply management, service delivery health promotion, research).

Keywords

TUBERCULOSIS – prevention and control
HIV INFECTIONS – prevention and control
ACQUIRED IMMUNODEFICIENCY SYNDROME
EPIDEMIOLOGIC SURVEILLANCE
HEALTH POLICY
DELIVERY OF HEALTH CARE
NATIONAL HEALTH PROGRAMS
EUROPE

ISBN 92 890 1089 4

Address requests about publications of the WHO Regional Office to:

• by e-mail
  publicationrequests@euro.who.int (for copies of publications)
  permissions@euro.who.int (for permission to reproduce them)
  pubrights@euro.who.int (for permission to translate them)

• by post
  Publications
  WHO Regional Office for Europe
  Scherfigsvej 8
  DK-2100 Copenhagen Ø, Denmark

© World Health Organization 2003

All rights reserved. The Regional Office for Europe of the World Health Organization welcomes requests for permission to reproduce or translate its publications, in part or in full.

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Where the designation "country or area" appears in the headings of tables, it covers countries, territories, cities, or areas. Dotted lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers’ products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the World Health Organization in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

The World Health Organization does not warrant that the information contained in this publication is complete and correct and shall not be liable for any damages incurred as a result of its use. The views expressed by authors or editors do not necessarily represent the decisions or the stated policy of the World Health Organization.
This document was prepared by Pierpaolo de Colombani (WHO Regional Office for Europe, Copenhagen, Denmark), Nicholas Banatvala (Department for International Development, London, United Kingdom), Richard Zaleskis (WHO Regional Office for Europe, Copenhagen, Denmark) and Dermot Maher (WHO headquarters, Geneva, Switzerland).

The document was reviewed by a Review Panel composed of: Tatiana Aleksandrina (National Tuberculosis Programme, Kiev, Ukraine), Andrew Ball (WHO headquarters, Geneva, Switzerland), Damijan Erzen (National Tuberculosis Programme, Golnik, Slovenia), Dominique Farge-Bancel (Saint-Louis Hospital, Paris, France), Peter Godfrey-Faussett (London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, United Kingdom), Andrea Infuso (Surveillance of Tuberculosis in Europe – EuroTB, Saint-Maurice, France), Srdan Matic (WHO Regional Office for Europe, Copenhagen, Denmark), Giovanni B. Maglione (Fondazione S. Maugeri, Tradate, Italy), Murdo Bijl (AIDS Foundation East-West, Moscow, Russian Federation), Hans Rieder (International Union against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, Paris, France), Tatiana Shoumilina (UNAIDS, Moscow, Russian Federation), Jaap Veen (KNCV, The Hague, the Netherlands) and Isabel Yordi Aguirre (WHO Regional Office for Europe, Copenhagen, Denmark).

Irina Eramova, Barbara Hauer, Jane Leese, Pieter Van Maaren, Emanuele Pontali, Pilar Ramon-Pardo, Alasdair Reid, Jerod Scholten and Anna Thorson provided valuable contributions to this document.
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Background</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Links between TB and HIV</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Epidemiology</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Aim, guiding principles and targets</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Aim</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Guiding principles</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Targets</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Priorities for TB/HIV in Europe</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Setting priorities among countries</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Populations at high risk of HIV and TB</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Strategic components</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Political commitment</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Collaborative prevention</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Intensified case-finding</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Coordinated treatment</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5 Strengthened surveillance</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Key operations</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Central coordination</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Policy development</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Surveillance</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Training</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 Supply management</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6 Service delivery</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7 Health promotion</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8 Research</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex 1. Main definitions</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex 3. Essential package of HIV/AIDS and TB interventions</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abbreviations

AIDS acquired immunodeficiency syndrome
ART antiretroviral therapy
ARV antiretroviral
CD4 CD4+ T lymphocyte count to measure the immune function
DOTS brand name of the WHO-recommended strategy for TB control
DOT directly observed treatment (for TB)
GDF Global TB Drug Facility
GFATM Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria
HAART highly active antiretroviral therapy
HIV human immunodeficiency virus
IDU injecting drug user
IPT isoniazid preventive therapy
MDR-TB multidrug-resistant tuberculosis
MIS management information system
MTCT mother-to-child transmission of HIV
MSM men having sex with men
NGO nongovernmental organization
PEP HIV post-exposure prophylaxis
PLWHA people living with HIV/AIDS
STI sexually transmitted infection
SW sex worker
TB tuberculosis
TB/HIV HIV-related tuberculosis
UNAIDS Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS
VCT voluntary counselling and testing (for HIV)
WHO World Health Organization
1. Introduction

The World Health Organization (WHO) declared tuberculosis (TB) to be a global emergency in 1993 (1) and formulated the DOTS strategy to control TB in 1994 (2). More recently, WHO published an expanded framework for effective TB control that covers the technical, managerial, social and political dimensions (3). By 2002, 155 countries were implementing the DOTS strategy (4). However, only 33% of global TB cases were reported to be covered by DOTS in 2001, with considerable variation between regions. The European Region of WHO reported 13% DOTS population coverage, the lowest among the WHO regions.

In 2001, the United Nations declared human immunodeficiency virus/acquired immunodeficiency syndrome (HIV/AIDS) to be a global emergency of devastating impact. Member States committed themselves with the Declaration of Commitment on HIV/AIDS of the United Nations General Assembly Special Session (UNGASS) on HIV/AIDS (5) to address the HIV/AIDS crisis urgently. Priority is given to ensuring access to care and support for the people living with HIV/AIDS (PLWHA) and to scaling up antiretroviral (ARV) therapy to reach 3 million PLWHA by 2005 (6).

TB and HIV/AIDS are global public health problems with considerable mutual interaction. Globally, TB is a leading killer of PLWHA. HIV is the most potent force driving the TB epidemic in countries with a high prevalence of HIV. Given the close interaction between the TB and HIV epidemics, the global Stop TB Partnership (http://www.stoptb.org) established the TB/HIV Working Group in 2001 to coordinate and promote interventions to decrease the burden of HIV-related TB (TB/HIV). The Working Group developed a global TB/HIV strategic framework (7) and supportive guidelines for implementation (8) that need to be adapted in each WHO region.

TB in Europe is declining in countries in western Europe and central Europe1, but the burden is still high and increasing in eastern

---

1 Central Europe here includes: Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Croatia, Czech Republic, Hungary, Poland, Romania, Serbia and Montenegro, Slovakia, Slovenia, The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia and Turkey.
HIV/AIDS, which has been prevalent in the past in countries in western Europe, is increasing dramatically in eastern Europe. TB/HIV morbidity and mortality are expected to accelerate significantly in the future in Europe.

In 2002, the WHO Regional Committee for Europe urged Member States to develop comprehensive, multisectoral, national HIV/AIDS strategic plans and programmes (10) and to promote effective collaboration between programmes to prevent and control TB and HIV (11). This framework results from the renewed commitment against TB and HIV/AIDS in Europe. It results from an extensive consultation process, including the Wolfheze Workshops on Tuberculosis Control in Europe (2001–2003) undertaken by the WHO Regional Office for Europe and by those responsible for national HIV/AIDS programme and national TB programmes and their partners.

This framework aims to guide European countries in developing their national plan for reducing TB/HIV morbidity and mortality. It builds on strategies developed globally and in Europe for TB control (3,12,13) and for HIV/AIDS prevention and care (14). It sets out the rationale for effective action to address TB/HIV, including the collaboration between national national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes. It identifies the populations at risk of TB and HIV and the strategic components and key operations required. The main target audience consists of policy-makers in ministries (especially ministries responsible for health, justice and the interior), international agencies and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs).

WHO will revise this framework in the future as further evidence becomes available to inform policy and practice related to TB/HIV. Readers are kindly invited to contact the WHO Regional Office for Europe with their views and comments.

---

2 Eastern Europe here includes: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Estonia, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Latvia, Lithuania, Republic of Moldova, Russian Federation, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Ukraine and Uzbekistan.
2. Background

2.1 Links between TB and HIV

HIV can fuel the TB epidemic in several ways \((15,16)\). HIV is the most potent known risk factor for progression to active TB in people with latent *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* infection. HIV also increases the rate of recurrent TB, either from endogenous reactivation or exogenous reinfection. Increasing TB cases among PLWHA enhances the risk of TB transmission to the general community, whether or not they are HIV infected. The level of immunodeficiency at which PLWHA usually develop TB is associated with higher case–fatality rates.

TB may adversely affect the natural history of AIDS in co-infected people, by stimulating HIV replication directly by *M. tuberculosis* and its cellular components and/or indirectly by releasing cytokines \((17,18)\). However, evidence for this is mainly based on studies in vitro \((19)\) and is not yet conclusive in epidemiological studies.

2.2 Epidemiology

WHO estimated that there were 484 000 new TB cases in Europe in 2001, representing 6% of the global TB burden. The Russian Federation had the ninth highest burden of TB in the world. Within Europe, the TB incidence varies enormously, from 5 per 100 000 population in Sweden to 181 per 100 000 population in Kazakhstan \((4)\). The female-male ratio was 0.4 among new pulmonary TB cases with a positive sputum smear. This may require research on gender inequality in accessing TB services in some settings \((20)\). High rates of TB are associated with socioeconomic crisis, weaknesses in health systems, epidemics of HIV and multidrug-resistant TB and poor interventions to control TB among vulnerable populations \((21)\).

Recent analysis shows that 2.6% of all new TB cases in Europe in 2000 were attributable to HIV coinfection \((22)\). In the Russian Federation, 1% of all new cases of TB were estimated to be HIV-positive, and 35% of the adults with AIDS have died from TB.

The Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS) and WHO estimate that Europe had about 1.77 million people living with HIV/AIDS in 2001: 4% of the global HIV/AIDS burden \((23,24)\). The HIV/AIDS epidemic in Europe is the fastest growing in the world. In
countries in eastern and central Europe, the HIV epidemic is mostly concentrated among specific high-risk groups, mainly injecting drug users (IDUs). Their numbers are rising dramatically in eastern European countries because of global drug trafficking, unemployment and poverty. In western Europe, the HIV epidemic started in the 1970s and 1980s and has reached a 0.3% prevalence in adults, mainly being transmitted by men who have sex with men (MSM) and IDUs. HIV surveillance needs to be strengthened further to better monitor the scale of the HIV epidemic and trends in Europe.

3. **Aim, guiding principles and targets**

3.1 **Aim**

The aim of this framework is to assist European countries in planning and implementing TB/HIV interventions jointly by national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes, with the objective of reducing HIV-related TB morbidity and mortality and minimizing the effects on individual people and on societies.

3.2 **Guiding principles**

This framework is based on the following guiding principles.

- Controlling TB/HIV requires implementing a range of interventions including those directly against TB and those directly against HIV (and therefore indirectly against TB).
- National HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes should receive the necessary support to fully implement their respective strategies for preventing HIV/AIDS and providing care and support and for controlling TB according to internationally recommended standards.
- National HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes should collaborate to ensure that people with HIV/AIDS and people with TB receive a continuum of high-quality care.
- Access to TB/HIV services is a human right; it should be protected by confidentiality, should be equitable and should exclude discrimination, including that based on stigma or gender.
3.3 Targets
There are internationally agreed global targets for TB and for HIV but not yet specifically for HIV-related TB. The World Health Assembly passed a resolution in 2000 urging that at least 70% of all new infectious TB cases be detected and that at least 85% of those detected be cured by 2005 (25). The Millennium Development Goals adopted at the Millennium Summit in September 2000 include the following targets: “to have halted by 2015 and begun to reverse the spread of HIV” and “to have halted by 2015 and begun to reverse the incidence of TB” (26). The TB/HIV Working Group is presently working to define global and regional targets for TB/HIV and monitoring indicators.

4. Priorities for TB/HIV in Europe
4.1 Setting priorities among countries
Countries in Europe face diverse challenges in responding to TB/HIV. The 52 countries vary considerably in the epidemiological burdens of HIV and TB and the type and quantities of new activities needed to provide the internationally recommended TB and HIV/AIDS services. A country with a high case load, an increasing epidemiological trend and inadequate resources and/or inadequate health system represents a priority for intervention.

Using the above criteria, the sexually transmitted infections (STI)/HIV/AIDS programme and the TB control programme of the WHO Regional Office for Europe have set priorities among European countries according to the need for HIV/AIDS prevention and control (27) and TB control (28) in the next 5 years. Table 1 further groups countries with a combined perspective for priority intervention. The countries with high needs for both HIV/AIDS prevention and control and TB control are also those with the highest need to address TB/HIV.
Table 1. Countries in the European Region according to priority for the need to prevent and control HIV/AIDS and to control TB

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priority for HIV/AIDS prevention and control</th>
<th>High</th>
<th>Belarus, Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania, Republic of Moldova, Russian Federation, Ukraine</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate</td>
<td>Italy, France, United Kingdom</td>
<td>Poland, Portugal, Spain, Turkey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Romania, Tajikistan, Uzbekistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Andorra, Austria, Belgium, Czech Republic, Cyprus, Denmark, Finland, Germany, Greece, Iceland, Ireland, Israel, Luxembourg, Malta, Monaco, Netherlands, Norway, San Marino, Slovakia, Slovenia, Sweden, Switzerland</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Croatia, Hungary, Serbia and Montenegro, The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Turkmenistan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.2 Populations at high risk of HIV and TB

Injecting drug users are at risk of HIV infection, TB and, in some settings, multidrug-resistant TB. More than two thirds of newly diagnosed HIV infections in eastern Europe are among IDUs (29). An estimated 1% or more of the population in eastern Europe (excluding
Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania) are IDUs and half are younger than 25 years. Sex partners of IDUs are at risk of HIV. IDUs often engage in sex work to support their injecting habit, which increases the risk of HIV transmission to the general population.

**Sex workers** are at higher risk of HIV because of behaviour such as unsafe sex and unsafe injecting drug use practices. SWs may represent a significant channel of HIV transmission to the general population.

**Prisoners** are at high-risk of TB, especially in crowded facilities. Moreover, prisoners often come from populations at high risk of HIV (30), because of the illicit nature of drug use and sex work and the high rates of property crime to support drug use by IDUs. The risk of TB infection and disease is consistently higher among prison inmates than among the general population, and this increases with the length of detention. Special issues for controlling TB among prisoners include: the rapid progression of clinical TB among HIV-positive prisoners; the spread of TB to other prisoners and prison staff; the spread of TB to the community at large when prisoners need hospital care or are released; and the additional costs of isolating, investigating and treating cases (31,32).

**Migrant populations** account officially for 2.7% of the European population or about 1% considering only those from countries outside Europe (33). Both European and non-European migrants contribute to the TB (9,34) and HIV epidemics. Difficulties in communication, accessing health care services, gender barriers and the often uncertain legal status of migrants pose particular problems for TB control and HIV prevention and care in this group.

**Health care users and health workers** often have greater risk of being exposed to *M. tuberculosis* (35). TB is most likely to be nosocomially transmitted from people with unrecognized pulmonary TB who have not started any anti-TB treatment and have not been isolated (36). The emergence of multidrug-resistant TB, often combined with HIV infection, confronts the health care community with unique challenges. Nosocomial TB transmission among HIV-infected patients in Europe has caused outbreaks with high case–fatality rates. HIV-infected people have a high attack rate and a shortened incubation period for TB and are susceptible to reinfection, including reinfection with drug-resistant strains.
5. **Strategic components**

The strategic framework to reduce the burden of TB/HIV in Europe is based on the collaboration of national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes in promoting five components: political commitment, collaborative prevention, intensified case-finding, coordinated treatment and strengthened surveillance. The collaboration of national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes is based on the guiding principles outlined in section 3.

5.1 **Political commitment** is needed to promote full implementation of the strategies for HIV/AIDS prevention and control, for TB control and for the programmes’ collaborative efforts to tackle TB/HIV. Establishing a national high-level committee may promote coordination, intrasectoral and intersectoral collaboration and additional political and financial support. Existing international initiatives should be utilized to foster government commitment and provide additional resources, such as the Stop TB Partnership and the Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria (http://www.globalfundatm.org).

5.2 **Collaborative prevention** for TB and HIV transmission. The core responsibilities of the national HIV/AIDS programme for HIV/AIDS prevention include promoting safer sex and safer injecting drug use, treating STI, screening blood for HIV, implementing universal precautions, providing prophylaxis to prevent mother-to-child transmission (MTCT) of HIV and diagnosing HIV infection early. All these interventions can reduce HIV transmission, thereby contributing to a declining burden of TB/HIV. The core responsibility of the national TB programme is to fully implement the international strategy for controlling TB. Three specific preventive interventions are recommended for collaborative action by national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes: Isoniazid preventive therapy, environmental measures and post-exposure prophylaxis.

5.2.1 Isoniazid preventive therapy (IPT) should be administered to PLWHA with a positive tuberculin skin test. This decreases the risk that recent *M. tuberculosis* infection
progresses and that latent infection is reactivated (37,38). Two important requirements are to exclude active TB and to ensure adherence to treatment (39). The widely used 6-month course is based on a cost–effectiveness study (40,41). Extending to 9 months might be considered to maximize the efficacy of IPT, depending on local conditions (42,43). Further evidence is necessary to guide IPT where isoniazid resistance is common (43).

5.2.2 Health care users and workers are exposed to a higher risk of TB and HIV transmission in health care facilities; this also applies to other settings (such as prisons). Environmental measures (35) can reduce TB transmission with minimal additional resources. These include separating or isolating infectious people (following early TB diagnosis and treatment), room ventilation, face masks for patients, laboratory safety and waste disposal. Universal precautions (44) should be also applied in HIV/AIDS and TB settings.

5.2.3 Occupational exposure to blood or other fluids that may contain HIV should be considered an urgent health concern in all settings, including TB facilities. HIV post-exposure prophylaxis (PEP) should be available for prompt administration in accordance with current recommendations (45).

5.3 **Intensified case-finding** of HIV among people with TB and of TB among PLWHA should be intensified, especially among the high-risk groups mentioned in the previous section. Early diagnosis of both conditions can limit transmission, decrease the related morbidity and mortality and improve people’s quality of life. Voluntary counselling and testing (VCT) is an important entry point for providing comprehensive care to PLWHA. This also includes antiretroviral therapy (ART) among TB patients and TB screening among PLWHA, followed by treatment or IPT (46). Investigation of PLWHA with respiratory symptoms consistent with TB should always include sputum smear microscopy (and culture for *M. tuberculosis* where available).
5.4 Coordinated treatment of PLWHA who have TB with anti-TB drugs and ARV drugs requires careful clinical management. TB treatment should usually have priority over antiretroviral therapy (ART). It should contain rifampicin and be initiated promptly and directly observed. Careful evaluation is necessary in judging when to start ART because of the potential interaction of ARV drugs with rifampicin and the risk of a paradoxical reaction (due to immune reconstitution syndrome). In patients with pulmonary TB and CD4 T-lymphocyte count exceeding 200 per mm$^3$, ART should be deferred until TB treatment is completed. In patients with a high risk of HIV disease progression and mortality – extrapulmonary TB or CD4 count less than 200 per mm$^3$ – ART should be provided concurrently with TB treatment. Recent publications (47,48) advise further on treating PLWHA who have TB. Intensive support to promote adherence to ART may include DOT.

5.5 Strengthened surveillance is critical in controlling TB (49,50) and HIV/AIDS (51,52). Effective surveillance provides data that can be used to develop evidence-based policy, to monitor programmes and to evaluate impact. An effective surveillance system should be able to identify the number and proportion of PLWHA who have TB, the number and proportion of TB patients who are HIV-positive, the risk factors associated with TB/HIV infection, the gender differences, the modalities and outcome of care (53,54) and the level of drug resistance (55). Surveillance systems for TB and HIV/AIDS should be sufficiently integrated to be able to perform these functions. Effective methods of linking data on TB and HIV/AIDS must preserve people’s right to confidentiality (56). Notification of HIV together with notification of the same person for other diseases should maintain confidentiality.

6. Key operations

To successfully promote the five strategic components in tackling TB/HIV, the national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes should jointly ensure eight key operations: central coordination, policy development, surveillance, training, supply
management, service delivery, health promotion and research. Each country should determine the most effective way of implementing these key operations, depending on the burden of TB/HIV, the organization of the health system and the availability of resources. The full involvement and participation of PLWHA and of TB patients in designing, planning, implementing and evaluating TB/HIV interventions is crucial.

6.1 **Central coordination** through a national TB/HIV coordinating committee enables national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes to jointly plan, implement, monitor and evaluate TB/HIV interventions. The committee should include managers from central and peripheral levels of relevant ministries (such as those responsible for health, the interior and justice) and civil society representatives (such as from patients’ organizations, other NGOs and the private sector).

6.2 **Policy development** supports the effective coordination of and collaboration on TB/HIV interventions. The main areas of work include: i) developing policies that promote closer collaboration between national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes; ii) reviewing the guidelines of national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes to ensure that they include TB/HIV; iii) developing national protocols and standards for good clinical practice, including ethics and confidentiality; iv) developing partnership with stakeholders, including NGOs (such as patients’ organizations and charitable organizations) and private enterprises; v) establishing referral systems between the services of national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes. An advisory group should develop national TB/HIV policies and guidelines. Such a group should include epidemiologists, public health officials and representatives of the ministry of health, other relevant ministries, NGOs and other partners such as specialized HIV/AIDS and drug control agencies.

6.3 **Surveillance** is critical for monitoring progress in implementing TB/HIV interventions (such as using population-based outcome measures) and evaluating progress towards achieving targets. Annex 2 lists specific TB/HIV
indicators that national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes can use, which may require revising forms and registers to collect data. The national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes should collaborate in sharing data while preserving patient confidentiality. Patient referral should be properly documented. Collecting and analysing data by gender and age helps to clarify the magnitude and nature of gender disparities and to inform prevention and care programmes. National and regional surveillance reports on HIV/AIDS should include TB as a priority HIV-related disease, and reports on TB should include HIV as an important factor that fuels TB.

6.4 **Training** on the job should be planned for personnel and other service providers (such as volunteers) to increase and update knowledge on the transmission, prevention and care of HIV/AIDS, TB and TB/HIV. It should also cover universal precautions against HIV and preventing HIV and TB transmission in special settings (such as hospitals, drug dependence treatment services and prisons). Training on how to communicate effectively with patients is also important, especially considering barriers resulting from stigma and social differences. Collaboration between universities, training institutions, professional societies and NGOs is important in developing graduate and postgraduate education and training for health staff involved in HIV/AIDS and TB programmes.

6.5 **Supply management** is essential to ensure an uninterrupted supply of high-quality anti-TB drugs. This enables TB patients to receive an uninterrupted course of effective treatment and reduces the risk of drug resistance. The same applies to effective IPT. When PLWHA are screened for TB by non-TB services, this should be supported by at least adequate supplies for collecting sputum smears and shipping the samples. Supply management is also a key issue for national HIV/AIDS programmes in scaling up ART to reach the target of 3 million PLWHA by 2005. The availability of ARV drugs may promote uptake of VCT. The national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes need to collaborate in providing PLWHA who have TB with ART, whether in TB or in infectious disease or HIV facilities. The
Global TB Drug Facility (GDF) provides a good model for procuring, controlling the quality of and distributing antiretroviral drugs.

6.6 **Service delivery** involves clarifying the professional and administrative responsibilities necessary to provide six priority collaborative services between the national TB programmes and national HIV/AIDS programmes (Annex 3): i) making available VCT for all TB patients; ii) referring TB patients who are found to be HIV-positive for lifelong HIV support, care and treatment; iii) detecting and treating TB among PLWHA; iv) ensuring IPT treatment to PLWHA who are infected with TB but found not to have active TB; v) applying universal HIV precautions and environmental TB measures for health care workers and users; vi) making available PEP for everyone exposed to HIV.

These collaborative services are part of an HIV/AIDS essential package that includes interventions against HIV (and therefore indirectly against TB) and interventions directly against TB. Services can be delivered at home and at the primary, secondary and tertiary levels of care. Service delivery in each country should be planned based on the epidemiology of TB/HIV, the organization of the health system and the resources available. NGOs may be key partners in serving populations at high risk of HIV and TB. As many PLWHA are injecting drug users, drug dependence treatment services should be also considered for delivering TB/HIV services. Services at the community level include community support for PLWHA and for TB patients to ensure that they adhere to treatment. Primary care services include VCT, IPT and TB treatment. The national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes should collaborate in exploring the possibility of jointly organizing DOT for anti-TB treatment and introducing ART. Universal HIV precautions and environmental TB measures should be also considered from primary care level. Secondary care services include diagnosing and treating common HIV-related diseases, including pulmonary and extrapulmonary TB (diagnosis usually requires such investigations as smear microscopy, radiography, biopsy and culture). PEP against
HIV infection should also be available in secondary health care facilities. Tertiary care services should include diagnosing and treating the complications of HIV-related diseases. Managing HIV/AIDS and TB patients requires a systematic, effective referral system between HIV and TB services and providing services sensitive to social, gender and cultural differences at all levels.

6.7 **Health promotion** through advocacy, communication and social mobilization is essential for expanding the HIV/AIDS and DOTS strategies. Combining the resources and experiences of national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes could enhance advocacy, communication and social mobilization. Reaching larger audiences is likely to increase political and financial support. More effective means and tools for social mobilization can be accessed and collaboration expanded to a larger number of partners (such as NGOs and the private sector) for communities demanding effective prevention, treatment and care of HIV/AIDS, TB and TB/HIV.

6.8 **Research** is essential in all public health programmes. National HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes have considerable unexploited potential synergy for TB/HIV intervention. Epidemiological research and surveillance should inform the priorities set among interventions and monitor their impact. Clinical research may improve the diagnosis, treatment and prophylaxis of HIV-related TB. Operational research is relevant to improving intensified TB case-finding, managing TB/HIV patients, supply, training and intrasectoral and intersectoral collaboration. Assessing the feasibility, effectiveness, affordability and cost–effectiveness of ART and IPT in central and eastern Europe is a priority (28). Where isoniazid resistance is common, research is needed to determine the appropriate preventive treatment regimen for TB. Research can help to explore the possible effects of gender inequality in accessing TB services (57).
Annex 1

MAIN DEFINITIONS

Countries in Europe with a low TB incidence: European countries with an annual notified incidence rate of less than 20 cases (all types of TB) per 100 000 population.

Directly observed treatment (DOT): A trained and supervised person observes the person swallowing the drugs. This is part of a range of measures to support people with TB and promote adherence to treatment.

The DOTS strategy: The recommended strategy for TB control that is expanded to apply to both HIV-related and drug-resistant forms of TB. It includes five elements: i) sustained political commitment to increase human and financial resources and make TB control a nationwide activity integral to a national health system; ii) access to quality-assured sputum microscopy for detecting cases of TB among people presenting with, or found through screening to have, symptoms of TB (most importantly, prolonged cough), with special attention to detecting cases among HIV-infected people and other high-risk groups, such as people living in institutions; iii) standardized short-course chemotherapy for all cases of TB under proper case–management conditions through technically sound and socially supportive treatment services, including direct observation of treatment; iv) an uninterrupted supply of quality-assured drugs with reliable systems of drug procurement and distribution; v) a recording and reporting system enabling outcome assessment of each and every patient and assessment of the overall performance of the programme.

Elimination of TB: Annual incidence of sputum smear–positive TB less than 1 case per million population or prevalence of infection with M. tuberculosis below 1% and declining.

Harm reduction: Policies or programmes that focus on reducing the harm resulting from the use of drugs (58). The term is used especially for policies and programmes that aim to reduce harm without necessarily affecting the underlying drug use and requiring abstention from drug use. Examples include needle and syringe exchange and distribution programmes to counteract needle-sharing among injecting
drug users and treatment of sexually transmitted infections among injecting drug users. However, harm reduction approaches are often the first step towards the eventual cessation of drug use.

**Highly active antiretroviral therapy (HAART):** Treatment based on multiple drugs, including a combination of protease inhibitors, nucleoside reverse transcriptase inhibitors and non-nucleoside reverse transcriptase inhibitors.

**HIV epidemic levels:** i) low level – HIV prevalence has not consistently exceeded 5% in any defined subpopulation; ii) concentrated – HIV prevalence consistently exceeding 5% in at least one defined subpopulation but below 1% in pregnant women in urban areas; iii) generalized – HIV prevalence consistently exceeding 1% in pregnant women.

**Population at high risk of TB:** Population with an annual notification rate of 100 cases or more (any type of TB) per 100 000 population.

**Voluntary counselling and testing (VCT):** Services providing pretest counselling, testing for HIV infection and post-test counselling for anyone wanting to know their HIV status.
### Annex 2

**Main indicators³ for monitoring and surveillance of TB/HIV programmes**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Numerator</th>
<th>Denominator</th>
<th>Source/Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Programme monitoring</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB/HIV policy</td>
<td>National policy or guidelines with TB/HIV links</td>
<td>Total budget for HIV/AIDS and/or TB</td>
<td>MIS²/annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB/HIV financing (%)</td>
<td>Budget spent on TB/HIV x 100</td>
<td>Total areas, units or groups</td>
<td>MIS/annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB/HIV coverage (%)</td>
<td>Areas, units or groups⁵ working in TB/HIV x 100</td>
<td>Total PLWHA (adults) needing IPT⁶</td>
<td>MIS/annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPT access (%)</td>
<td>PLWHA (adults) who started IPT x 100</td>
<td>Total PLWHAs with environmental measures for TB⁸</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental control of TB (%)</td>
<td>HIV settings⁹ with environmental measures for TB</td>
<td>Total HIV settings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEP access (%)</td>
<td>TB health care workers who received PEP x 100</td>
<td>Total TB health care workers exposed to HIV</td>
<td>MIS/annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VCT access (%)</td>
<td>TB cases counselled for HIV testing x 100</td>
<td>Total TB cases</td>
<td>MIS/annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VCT positivity rate (%)</td>
<td>New TB cases found to be HIV positive x 100</td>
<td>Total new TB cases counselled and tested for HIV</td>
<td>MIS/quarterly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB diagnosis access (%)</td>
<td>New VCT clients screened for TB x 100</td>
<td>Total new VCT clients</td>
<td>MIS/quarterly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB treatment outcome (%)</td>
<td>PLWHA by TB treatment outcome x 100</td>
<td>Total PLWHA registered for TB treatment</td>
<td>MIS/quarterly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epidemiological surveillance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB notification rate in PLWHA (%)</td>
<td>New PLWHA notified with TB (all forms) x 100</td>
<td>Total new PLWHA notified</td>
<td>Survey/annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV prevalence in TB cases (%)</td>
<td>TB cases testing HIV-positive x 100</td>
<td>Total TB cases tested for HIV</td>
<td>Survey³/annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB mortality among PLWHA (per 1000)</td>
<td>PLWHA dying from TB x 100</td>
<td>Total PLWHA</td>
<td>MIS/annually</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

³ All indicators must refer to the standards established by national policies and guidelines.
⁴ Management Information System (MIS)
⁵ Referring to any implementation setting, such as administrative (district), geographical (settlement), health facility or high-risk population.
⁶ PLWHA needing IPT are those with a positive tuberculin skin test who have had active TB ruled out.
⁷ Referring to any setting previously identified in which HIV-infected people are routinely brought together.
⁸ Environmental measures for TB as defined by the national TB programme.
⁹ Serosurveillance with unlinked anonymous HIV testing. See also the relevant guidelines (46).
Annex 3

**ESSENTIAL PACKAGE OF HIV/AIDS AND TB INTERVENTIONS**

The table lists an essential package of HIV/AIDS interventions and TB interventions that health care systems should provide (8). They are against HIV (and therefore indirectly against TB) and directly against TB. The services in bold require collaboration between national HIV/AIDS programmes and national TB programmes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interventions directly targeting HIV10 (and therefore indirectly TB)</th>
<th>Interventions directly targeting TB</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Preventing transmission</strong></td>
<td><strong>Diagnosing and treating infectious cases</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safer drug use</td>
<td>Safe blood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• harm reduction</td>
<td>• Antiretroviral therapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• substitution therapy</td>
<td>Montefeltro bacilli</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safer sex</td>
<td>Universal precautions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• condom promotion</td>
<td><strong>Diagnosing early stages of infection or disease</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• reducing the number of sexual partners</td>
<td>Voluntary counselling and testing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voluntary counselling and testing</td>
<td>Sputum smear microscopy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention and treatment of sexually transmitted infections</td>
<td>Intensified case-finding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention of mother-to-child transmission</td>
<td><strong>Preventing progression from infection to disease</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antiretroviral therapy</td>
<td><strong>Isoniazid preventive therapy</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safe blood</td>
<td><strong>Treatment and care</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Universal precautions</strong></td>
<td><strong>Rifampicin-containing anti-TB regimen</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voluntary counselling and testing</td>
<td><strong>Directly observed treatment</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antiretroviral therapy</td>
<td>Postexposure prophylaxis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postexposure prophylaxis</td>
<td><strong>Treatment of complications (including TB)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antiretroviral therapy</td>
<td>Cotrimoxazole prophylaxis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cotrimoxazole prophylaxis</td>
<td>Prevention of fungal infection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevention of fungal infection</td>
<td>Treatment of common infections (pneumonia, diarrhoea and Candida)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treatment of tumours (Kaposi’s sarcoma and lymphoma)</td>
<td>Treatment of tumours (Kaposi’s sarcoma and lymphoma)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nutritional supplementation</td>
<td>Treatment of less common infections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treatment of complications</td>
<td>Palliative care</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10 These may target high-risk behaviour, environments or communities.
References

11. WHO Regional Committee for Europe. Scaling-up the response to tuberculosis in the European Region of WHO. Copenhagen, WHO Regional Office for Europe, 2002 (EUR/RC52/R8).


The WHO Regional Office for Europe

The World Health Organization (WHO) is a specialized agency of the United Nations created in 1948 with the primary responsibility for international health matters and public health. The WHO Regional Office for Europe is one of six regional offices throughout the world, each with its own programme geared to the particular health conditions of the countries it serves.

Member States

Albania
Andorra
Armenia
Austria
Azerbaijan
Belarus
Belgium
Bosnia and Herzegovina
Bulgaria
Croatia
Cyprus
Czech Republic
Denmark
Estonia
Finland
France
Georgia
Germany
Greece
Hungary
Iceland
Ireland
Israel
Italy
Kazakhstan
Kyrgyzstan
Latvia
Lithuania
Luxembourg
Malta
Monaco
Netherlands
Norway
Poland
Portugal
Republic of Moldova
Romania
Russian Federation
San Marino
Serbia and Montenegro
Slovakia
Slovenia
Spain
Sweden
Switzerland
Tajikistan
The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia
Turkey
Turkmenistan
Ukraine
United Kingdom
Uzbekistan

World Health Organization
Regional Office for Europe

Scherfigsvej 8, DK-2100 Copenhagen Ø, Denmark
Tel.: +45 39 17 17 17. Fax: +45 39 17 18 18. E-mail: postmaster@euro.who.int
Web site: www.euro.who.int