Technical Advisory Group on Tuberculosis for the WHO European Region

Report of the Twelfth Meeting
19–20 February 2018 Copenhagen, Denmark
Abstract

The Twelfth Meeting of the European Technical Advisory Group on Tuberculosis was held in Copenhagen on 19–20 February 2018. The objectives of the Meeting were to: (i) review the progress made in implementing the recommendations of the Seventeenth Meeting of the Strategic and Technical Advisory Group for Tuberculosis and the Eleventh Meeting of the Technical Advisory Group on Tuberculosis; (ii) review the status of implementation of the Tuberculosis Action Plan for the WHO European Region 2016–2020; (iii) advise on measures to take to support Member States to achieve more impact against TB through a sustainable development approach; and (iv) advise on steps needed to build on political commitment from the Moscow Ministerial Conference to the United Nations General Assembly high-level meeting on tuberculosis.
Contents

ABBREVIATIONS ........................................................................................................................................ iii

INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................................................ 1

RECOMMENDATIONS .................................................................................................................................. 1

Overall recommendation to WHO Regional Office for Europe work on TB and X- and MDR-TB ................................................................................................................................. 2

Adopting a sustainable, intersectoral approach to combat TB .............................................................. 2

Promoting political commitment and accountability for TB prevention and care .......................... 3

Procedural recommendations for TAG-TB meetings ........................................................................ 3

ANNEX 1. SCOPE AND PURPOSE ......................................................................................................... 4

ANNEX 2. PROGRAMME ......................................................................................................................... 5

ANNEX 3. LIST OF PARTICIPANTS ......................................................................................................... 7
Abbreviations

HIV  human immunodeficiency virus
MDR-TB  multidrug-resistant tuberculosis
TAG-TB  Technical Advisory Group on Tuberculosis
TB  tuberculosis
UN  United Nations
UNGA  United Nations General Assembly
XDR-TB  extensively drug-resistant tuberculosis
Introduction

The Twelfth Meeting of the European Technical Advisory Group on Tuberculosis (TAG-TB) was held in Copenhagen, Denmark, on 19–20 February 2018.

The overall objective of TAG-TB is to provide an independent review and expert technical opinion regarding tuberculosis (TB), drug-resistant TB and HIV-associated TB to the WHO Regional Director for Europe.

The specific objectives of the Meeting were to:

- review the progress made in implementing the recommendations of the Seventeenth Meeting of the Strategic and Technical Advisory Group for Tuberculosis and the Eleventh Meeting of TAG-TB (13–14 February 2017);
- review the status of implementation of the Tuberculosis Action Plan for the WHO European Region 2016–2020;
- advise on measures to support Member States to improve TB prevention and care through a sustainable development approach; and
- advise on steps to build on the political commitment from Moscow Ministerial Conference to the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) high-level meeting on TB in September 2018.

The scope and purpose, programme, and list of participants of the Meeting can be found in Annexes 1–3. The Meeting was chaired by Professor Alberto Matteelli.

TAG-TB congratulated the WHO Regional Office for Europe and Member States of the Region on their achievements over the last year. The substantial actions taken by the Regional Office and consequently by Member States have had significant results: TB incidence rates are decreasing across many countries. However, challenges remain: the proportion of multidrug-resistant TB (MDR-TB) cases is increasing, numbers of TB/HIV coinfection cases are rising and challenges remain in reforming the health care systems towards ambulatory TB care. These trends all need to be addressed.

The UNGA high-level meeting on TB in September 2018 will support the Regional strategy for effective intersectoral actions and to leave no one behind in ending TB. TAG-TB congratulates the Regional Office for organizing this event.

Recommendations

This section lists the main recommendations of TAG-TB including, where relevant, for reports to be produced for presentation at the Thirteenth TAG-TB Meeting in 2019.
Overall WHO Regional Office for Europe work on TB and M- and XDR-TB

1. Continue discussions with recipient countries of the Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria on the transition to domestic financing mechanisms for TB detection, treatment and care. Together with the Member States, analyse and highlight areas at risk of suffering a funding gap after 2020, and discuss future actions with the Member States and the Global Fund. 
   Product: an internal report.

2. Collect and share the best case studies of MDR-TB prevention and care at the national level (possibly from Kazakhstan, Latvia and Lithuania), including the effectiveness and safety of transitioning from hospital-based to ambulatory-based care for extensively drug-resistant TB (XDR-TB) and MDR-TB patients. Ideally, a description of drug resistance patterns in XDR-TB strains to be included.
   Product: WHO Regional Office for Europe publication.

3. Continue implementing the European Respiratory Society/WHO TB e-Consilium and encourage Member States to complement and strengthen this with national and subnational committees/consiliums for managing X- and MDR-TB. National committees/consiliums to ideally use electronic platforms for communication, with support from the Regional Office.
   Product: internal report, to be presented at the Thirteenth TAG-TB Meeting.

4. WHO has just published the global policy document on isoniazid resistance and use of fluoroquinolones, WHO treatment guidelines for isoniazid-resistant tuberculosis. An expert panel (including the regional Green Light Committee) is to be convened to determine whether the Regional Office is to follow the global recommendation. To provide relevant information for the panel, the Regional Office to analyse drug-resistance patterns in selected high-priority countries, paying special attention to isoniazid resistance by mutation type and quinolone resistance.
   Product: an expert panel report.

5. Develop a set of minimum standards for palliative care (including psychosocial and educational support) for XDR-TB patients and include palliative care as a discussion topic in the Thirteenth TAG-TB Meeting in 2019.
   Product: an internal report.

Adopting a sustainable, intersectoral approach to combat TB

6. Promote the strategy to combat TB at both country and regional levels using an intersectoral approach by encouraging the use of existing mechanisms and platforms (e.g. national strategic plans, country coordinating mechanisms, United Nations Development Assistance Frameworks) and to support WHO country officers to work with government ministers to encourage intersectoral collaboration.

7. Support national TB prevention and care programmes to work with ministries beyond the health ministry (e.g. Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Social Affairs, Ministry of Finance) and encourage Member States to update national TB action plans to include intersectoral actions and sustainable development.

8. Work with Member States to embed TB prevention and care into a model that encourages adoption of a whole-of-government approach to tackle the wider social determinants of TB by bringing together stakeholders from health and non-health backgrounds.

9. Support Member States in empowering front-line staff in the health sector and beyond (e.g. doctors, TB nurses, social workers, TB support workers and police) to pursue a more people-centred model of
care and to actively mediate the interface between health care services and patients to build trust within communities.

**Promoting political commitment and accountability for TB prevention and care**

TAG-TB recommends the following actions to ensure the 2018 UNGA high-level meeting on TB builds on the level of political commitment achieved at the Moscow Ministerial Conference.

10. Together with partners, advocate for high-level political representation beyond the ministries of health, as well as representation from civil society organizations, in country delegations to the upcoming UNGA meeting, paying special attention to high-priority countries.

11. Support Member States (especially high-priority countries) in packaging country-specific advocacy material for non-health sector stakeholders/ministers prior to the UNGA meeting. This could include:
   - a brief factsheet/infographic for non-health sector stakeholders covering the core facts on TB and the benefits of investing in TB (e.g. $1 spent leads to $43 saved, as reported at the Moscow Ministerial Conference);
   - a brief factsheet/infographic illustrating the wider social determinants of TB;
   - an overview of the core actions needed to end TB in the country; and
   - an updated country profile.

12. Advocate for the global accountability framework to include the monitoring of political commitment and social indicators, as well as epidemiological indicators.

13. Together with high-priority countries, develop a strategy/action/follow-up plan for implementation after the UNGA, using existing platforms and frameworks.

**Procedural recommendations for TAG-TB meetings**

14. Recommendations made at the Eleventh Meeting of TAG-TB which have not yet been achieved to be carried forward and reported on at next TAG-TB meeting (including recommendations on access to second-line drugs, national barriers and the adoption of short treatment regimens).

15. More specific progress reports on TAG-TB recommendations to include descriptions of inputs, output/products and possible outcomes (if any). A progress report on recommendations from the Eleventh Meeting of TAG-TB in 2017 to be shared with TAG-TB members two months after the Twelfth Meeting of TAG-TB.

16. Presentations and other relevant materials to be provided to members two weeks before the Thirteenth Meeting of TAG-TB.

17. A midterm virtual TAG-TB meeting (by video) to be arranged to evaluate the implementation status of the latest TAG-TB recommendations.
Annex 1. Scope and purpose

Main objective

To provide independent review and expert technical opinion in prevention and care of TB, drug-resistant TB and HIV-associated TB to the Director of the WHO Regional Office for Europe.

Specific objectives

The specific objectives of the Twelfth Meeting of TAG-TB were to:

1. review the progress made in implementing the recommendations of the Seventeenth Meeting of the Strategic and Technical Advisory Group for Tuberculosis and the Eleventh Meeting of TAG-TB;
2. review the status of implementation of the Tuberculosis Action Plan for the WHO European Region, 2016–2020;
3. advise on measures to take to support Member States to achieve higher impact on TB through a sustainable development approach; and
4. advise on the steps to take to build on political commitment from Moscow Ministerial Conference to UNGA high-level meeting on TB
Annex 2. Programme

Day 1. 19 February 2018

SESSION 1
10:00–10:10 Introduction
Nedret Emiroğlu, Director, Division of Health Emergencies and Communicable Diseases (DEC)

10:10–10:25 Review of the terms of reference and membership of TAG-TB; review of the declarations of conflict of interest, election of vice-chair of TAG-TB
Masoud Dara, Coordinator, Communicable Diseases & Programme Manager, Joint Tuberculosis, HIV & viral Hepatitis (JTH)

SESSION 2
10:25–10:45 Updates
Irina A. Vasilyeva, Member of STAG-TB and Chief TB Specialist of the Ministry of Health, Moscow, Russian Federation

10:45–11:05 Update on implementation of the Tuberculosis Action Plan for the WHO European Region, 2016-2020
Martin van den Boom, Technical Officer, JTH

11:05–11:30 Questions and answers, discussion

11:30–11:50 Progress in the implementation of the recommendations from the 11th Meeting of TAG-TB, Copenhagen, 13-14 February 2017
Martin van den Boom

11:50–12:10 Overview of the TB epidemiology in the WHO European Region
Ms Annemarie Rinder-Stengaard

12:10–12:35 Discussion

12:35–12:45 Group photo

SESSION 3
14:00–14:45 Specific questions to TAG-TB
Achieving higher impact on TB prevention and care in the WHO European Region in the era of SDGs and through a sustainable development approach
Presenter: Vittoria Gemelli
Discussant: Sarah R. Anderson, TAG-TB

15:15– 16:15 Discussion

16:15–16:45 Wrap-up and closure of the day
DAY 2. 20 February 2018

09:00–09:30 Steps to take to build on political commitment from Moscow Ministerial Conference to UNGA high level meeting on TB
Presenter: Masoud Dara
Discussant: Alberto Matteelli, TAG-TB

09:30–10:30 Discussion

10:50–12:50 Discussion on the main recommendations of the TAG-TB 12th Meeting

12:50–13:00 Closure of the TAG-TB Twelfth Meeting

Masoud Dara
Nedret Emiroğlu
Annex 3. List of participants

TAG-TB Members

Dr Sarah R. Anderson
sarah.anderson@phe.gov.uk

Ms Tsira Chakhaia
TBPEOPLE, Tbilisi, Georgia
tschakhaia@gmail.com

Mr Alexandre Lourenco
Hospital Administrator, Coimbra Hospital and University Centre, Coimbra, Portugal
alexander.lourenco@icloud.com

Professor Alberto Matteelli
Chair of TAG-TB and Director, WHO Collaborating Centre on TB/HIV and TB Elimination, University Department of Infectious and Tropical Diseases, University of Brescia and Brescia Spedali Civili General Hospital
alberto.matteelli@unibs.it

Dr Nigorsulton Muzafarova
Lead Product Quality Officer, Stop TB Partnership Secretariat, Geneva, Switzerland
nigorsultonm@stoptb.org

Dr Natalya Nizova
Public Health Specialist, Kyiv, Ukraine
natalya.nizova@gmail.com
Dr Leen Rigouts
Director, Unit of Mycobacteriology, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium
LRigouts@itg.be

Professor Irina A. Vasilyeva (member of the Strategic and Technical Advisory Group for Tuberculosis)
Director, Research Institute of Phthisiopulmonology I.M. Sechenov, Chief TB Specialist, Ministry of Health, Moscow, Russian Federation
vasil39@list.ru

Dr Askar Yedilbayev
Programme Director for the Russian Federation and Kazakhstan, Partners in Health, Boston, USA
askar@pih.org

Temporary Advisers
Professor Giovanni Sotgiu
Professor of Medical Statistics and Clinical Epidemiology, Epidemiology and Medical Statistics Unit, Department of Biomedical Sciences, Faculty of Medicine, University of Sassari, Sassari, Italy
gsotgiu@uniss.it

Observers
Ms Isabela Barbosa
Technical Adviser, Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS' Special Advisor for HIV, Geneva, Switzerland
isabela@michelkazatchkine.com

Dr Stela Bivol
Director, Center for Health Policies and Studies (PAS Center), Chişinău, the Republic of Moldova
Stela.Bivol@pas.md
Mr Lasha Goguadze
Senior Health Officer, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent, Geneva, Switzerland
Lasha.Goguadze@ifrc.org

Dr Davron Mukhamadiev
Regional Health and Care Coordinator for Europe, International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, Budapest, Hungary
davron.mukhamadiev@ifrc.org

Dr Svetlana Nicolaescu
Program Coordinator, Center for Health Policies and Studies (PAS Center), Chișinău, Republic of Moldova
svetlana.nicolaescu@pas.md

Mr Paul Sommerfeld
Director, TB Alert, Brighton, United Kingdom
paul.sommerfeld@tbalert.org

Dr Marieke van der Werf
Head of Tuberculosis Programme, European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control, Stockholm, Sweden
Marieke.vanderWerf@ecdc.europa.eu

**World Health Organization**

**WHO Regional Office for Europe**

Dr Andrei Dadu
Medical Officer, Joint TB, HIV and Viral Hepatitis programme
dadua@who.int
Dr Masoud Dara  
Coordinator, Communicable Diseases & Programme Manager, Joint Tuberculosis, HIV and Viral Hepatitis programme  
daram@who.int

Dr Nedret Emiroğlu  
Director, Division of Health Emergencies and Communicable Diseases  
emiroglun@who.int

Dr Sayohat Hasanova  
Technical Officer, Joint Tuberculosis, HIV and Viral Hepatitis programme  
hasanaovs@who.int

Dr Antons Mozalevskis  
Medical Officer, Joint Tuberculosis, HIV and Viral Hepatitis programme  
mozalevskisa@who.int

Mr Bhim Pradhan  
Administrative Assistant, Joint Tuberculosis, HIV and Viral Hepatitis programme  
Pradhanb@who.int

Ms Vittoria Gemelli  
Consultant, Joint Tuberculosis, HIV and Viral Hepatitis programme  
gemelliv@who.int

Ms Annemarie Rinder Stengaard  
Epidemiologist, Joint Tuberculosis, HIV and Viral Hepatitis programme  
bollerupa@who.int
Dr Martin van den Boom  
Technical Officer, Joint Tuberculosis, HIV and Viral Hepatitis programme  
vandenboomm@who.int

Ms Regina Winter  
Consultant, Division of Health Systems and Public Health  
winterr@who.int

**WHO European Region Country Offices**

Dr Gazmend Bejtja  
National Public Health Officer, WHO Country Office, Tirana, Albania  
bejtjag@who.int

Dr Gayane Ghukasyan  
National Professional Officer, WHO Country Office, Yerevan, Armenia  
ghukasyang@who.int

Dr Viatcheslav Grankov  
National Professional Officer, WHO Country Office, Minsk, Belarus  
grankovv@who.int

Dr Nino Mamulashvili  
National Professional Officer, WHO Country Office, Tbilisi, Georgia  
mamulashvilin@who.int

Mr Szabolcs Szigeti  
National Professional Officer, WHO Country Office, Budapest, Hungary  
szigetis@who.int
Dr Gazmend Zhuri
National Professional Officer, Pristina, Kosovo (in accordance with United Nations Security Council Resolution 1244 [1999]).
zhurig@who.int

Dr Cassandra Butu
National Professional Officer, WHO Country Office, Bucharest, Romania
butua@who.int

Dr Nikita Afanasyev
National Professional Officer, WHO Country Office, Moscow, Russian Federation
afanasyevn@who.int

Ms Ekaterina Simko
Administrative Assistant, WHO Country Office, Moscow, Russian Federation
simkoe@who.int

Dr Jamshid Gadoev
National Professional Officer, WHO Country Office, Tashkent, Uzbekistan
gadoevj@who.int

Mr Mustafa Bahadir Sucakli
National Professional Officer, WHO Country Office, Istambul, Turkey
sucaklim@who.int

Rapporteur
Nina Bjerglund Andersen
Public Health Science Communication 2.0, Copenhagen, Denmark
ninabjerglund@gmail.com